

Minutes



10035 108 ST NW FLR 10
EDMONTON AB T5J 3E1
CANADA

Ph (780) 427-9793
Fax (780) 422-3127
Email casa@casahome.org

Human Health / Animal Health Working Group Meeting #1

Date: June 17th, 2003
Time: 9:30 – 3:30
Place: 10th Floor Board Room
CASA – 10035 108 Street, Edmonton

In attendance:

Name	Organization
Randy Angle	Alberta Environment
Matthew Dance	CASA
Kim Eastlick	Energy and Utilities Board
Margaret Fisher	Alberta Veterinary Association
Geoff Granville	Shell / CPPI
Judy Huntley	Bert Riggall Environmental Foundation
Ila Johnston	Parkland Airshed Management Zone
Wayne Johnston	Farmer
Martha Kostuch	Prairie Acid Rain Coalition
Alex Mackenzie	Alberta Health and Wellness
Penny Mosmann	Health Canada
Greg Ritz	Parkland Airshed Management Zone
David Swann	Public Health Physician
John Squarek	Canadian Association of Petroleum Producers
Donna Tingley	CASA
Ruth Yanor	Mewassin Community Action Group

Action Items:

Task	Who	When
1.1: Draft a terms of reference for the Human and Animal Health Implementation team to comment on.	Matthew Dance, Geoff Granville, and the co-chairs	August 22 nd
1.2: Forward the Animal Health Project Team and the Human Health Project Team's final recommendations for review.	Matthew	September 4 th
1.3: Contact AAFR&D, Surface Rights Board and Farmers Advocate to enquire about their interest in joining this team.	Matthew	September 4 th
1.4: Contact Agriculture Canada to enquire about their interest in joining this team.	Penny Mosmann	September 4 th
1.5: Contact the Council of Medical Officers of Health, and First Nations to enquire about their interest in joining this team.	Ruth Yanor	September 4 th
1.6: Provide a name and organization to contact regarding the livestock industries interest at this table.	Margaret Fisher	September 4 th
1.7: Contact the NRCB to enquire about their interest in joining this team.	Kim Eastlick	September 4 th

1.8: Contact the Chemical Industry Association to enquire about their interest in joining this team.	Geoff Granville	September 4 th
1.9: Contact the Electricity Generation Industry to enquire about their interest in joining this team.	John Squarek	September 4 th
1.10: Forward their co-chair selection to Matthew by the end of June.	The Government Sector	June 30 th

Donna Tingley convened the meeting at 9:34 AM.

1. Welcome / introductions
a. Approve agenda.

The agenda was approved as tabled.

2. Introduction to the CASA process

Matthew Dance presented an overview of the CASA process with a focus on consensus decision making and ground rules for participation.

The following points were made in discussion:

- This process is very powerful in providing an understanding in a range of perspectives
- The results of the consensus process are innovative and seek to meet the needs of the participants.

Information regarding the CASA process and consensus decision making can be found at the following locations:

- www.casahome.org
- By contacting the CASA office or Matthew Dance at 780.427.9793.

How does this first meeting fit into the process?:

- To define a terms of reference that will go to the CASA board for approval
- To ensure that all of the interested parties are represented at the table
- To identify the resources needed to complete the work
- The next CASA board meeting is on September 18th, if a terms of reference can be developed by late August, we can seek approval from the Board at that time.

3. Human Health Project Team Recommendations

Alex Mackenzie provided a summary of the Human Health Project Team's final recommendations.

Overview

The components of the comprehensive human health and air quality monitoring system are:

- Symptoms and public health complaints
- Known human health effects of air contaminants
- Information about relevant event occurrences
- Ambient air quality monitoring data

•Human health effects monitoring data

Resources required:

Software development \$ 50K

- inputs
- define data elements to be recorded
- identify potential users of the software
- develop the required interface
- outputs

Reporting requirements: what, to whom and when should be reported

Data analysis

A 1-800 line at the Poison Control Centre \$ 200K

Discussion:

- Surprise was expressed at the amount to establish a 1-800 line at the Poison Control Centre.
- The cost would include a full time toxicologist to address the more difficult cases / calls.
- The nursing staff is very knowledgeable, with more training they may be able to supplement or replace the toxicologist's role.
- This line could also be a resource for other health care professionals such as rural doctors and veterinarians.
- Can we find the funding for this?
- It is tough to get funding right now – resources are stretched quite thin.
- The 1-800 line could play a secondary role by collecting health data to help identify a specific geographical area that may be subject to low level chronic illness within the population.
- Mixtures, which are more commonly found in the environment, are not addressed by the ambient air guidelines.
- There is no way to measure mixtures and their impact on human health – ambient guidelines are set with a safety factor to help minimize the effects.
- Could this be part of a research strategy?
- Difficult because research has a start and end date and we are looking for a long term strategy to monitor human health.
- Is there an Alberta Health and Wellness (AHW) budget for the human health component of WISSA?
- If the human health component is deemed necessary based on the results of the animal health section of the study, AHW will fund it.

4. Animal Health Project Team Recommendations

Martha Kostuch provided a summary of the Animal Health Project Team's work and final recommendations.

Highlights of the work completed by the Animal Health Project Team (AHPT) include:

- Workshop attended by farmers, industry and animal health care professionals.

- Survey distributed to NGO's, Industry and Farmers.
- Development of the Health and Environmental Record System.
- Development of the Community Monitoring Brochure and support web site.
- Final report with recommendations approved by the CASA Board.

AHPT Recommendations:

1. The AHPT recommends that the following two documents be printed and be made available according to the distribution plan:
 - The Herd and Environmental Record System to livestock owners.
 - The Community Monitoring Brochure to landowners living in proximity to emission sources.
2. The AHPT recommends that the proposed complaints/response line, which is part of the approved Human Health Monitoring System, be expanded to enable documentation of and response to animal health complaints related to air pollution.
3. The Animal Health Project Team recommends that the Surface Rights Board develop and implement an awareness campaign so landowners are more aware of the Board's existence, its mandate and its responsibility for compensation regarding animal health issues.
4. The AHPT recommends that research be encouraged, supported and funded by the Alberta Government in the following areas:
 - Chemistry, toxicity, interaction and cumulative effects of mixtures of pollutants.
 - Effects of air pollution on reproduction and immunology.
 - Identification of biomarkers.
 - Exposure level assessment.
5. The AHPT recommends that its recommendations for improving the credibility of research be considered by any organization undertaking major research projects on the effects of air pollution on animal health.
6. The AHPT recommends that a Human and Animal Health Implementation Team be established to:
 - Review and implement, if still appropriate, the recommendations from the Human Health Project Team.
 - Implement recommendations from the Animal Health Project Team.
 - Organize a workshop(s) to disseminate information about HERS to the farming community.
 - Receive information about current and future research in the areas of human and animal health.
 - Provide input into current and future research.
 - Identify emerging issues in the areas of human and animal health, and recommend actions to address those issues.
 - Provide information support to other project teams.
 - Periodically evaluate, review and make any needed changes to the Herd and Environmental Record System and the Community Monitoring Brochure.

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Discussion:

- Surface Rights Board is in the process of creating a web site to support their recommendation.
- The credibility of research recommendation is not applicable to smaller research projects.
- Multi-stakeholder, consensus process is specific to larger projects.
- But, study design, hypothesis definition, and other basic research methodology is applicable to all projects, regardless of size.

Why did the Animal Health project Team recommend that the Human Health and Animal Health Implementation Team be formed?

- The substances that affect human health also affect animal health.
- What we understand of the effects of air emissions on humans often starts with an understanding of animal health.
- There is a need for both human and animal health implementation teams – having separate teams did not make sense because of the overlap of issues.

5. Interests and expectations**a. Describe your sectors interest in this project**

Ruth Yanor – Mewassin Community Action Council

- Lives in a community with 4 coal fired power plants in close proximity.
- Human and animals down wind of power plants affected by emissions.
- Increased percentage of cancers, multiple sclerosis, and other health effects in her community.
- The implementation of human health and animal health recommendations is important.
- To learn more about health effects.

Randy Angle – Alberta Environment

- Air issues and support for CASA are part of AENV 3 year business plan.
- The Business Plan is outcomes oriented.
- Supporting CASA's vision of clean air.

Kim Eastlick – Alberta Energy and Utilities Board (EUB)

- EUB is responsible for the regulation of the oil and gas industry.
- Interested in improving A/Q, also in requirements and regulation.
- To develop and maintain linkages in research and between interested parties.
- Provide information and resources.
- Interested in the outcome of a health reporting system.

Margaret Fisher – Alberta Veterinary Association

- Monitoring and gathering of information.
- Verification problems – veterinary pathology and post mortems.
- Cause and effects – air emissions and health concerns.

- Veterinarians are often involved in communities.
- Gather information for veterinarians and provide a veterinarian's perspective.

Greg Ritz – Parkland Airshed Management Zone

- Public health inspector.
- Humans and animals are designed to operate on clean air.
- Interested in linkages – humans as receptors and links to the outcomes of air pollution.

Penny Mosmann – Health Canada

- Integration of issues.
- Health Canada mandate.
- Alberta Health and Wellness / Health Canada looking to support one another.

Judy Huntley – Bert Riggall Environmental Foundation

- Concerns with local sustainability issues.
- Creation of synergy groups.

David Swann – Public Health

- CASA an important example of a decision making process.
- Finding a voice as a citizen and professor.
- Forum to continue dialogue – we can make a difference.
- Health status – monitoring the health of the population.
- Understanding complex exposures.

John Squarek – Canadian Association of Petroleum Producers (CAPP)

- CAPP – 140 members producing 95% of the oil and gas in Canada.
- Interested in better understanding of the issues.
- Tie ideas into the CAPP stewardship program.
- Connection with CAPP membership.
- Research to provide missing data.
- How to develop research programs to provide data.
- Communication – to develop understanding with the public.

Ila Johnston – Parkland Airshed Management Zone

- Represented PAMZ on the AHPT – to see the AHPT recommendations through.
- Hear a lot of complaints in community regarding air quality.
- A voice for those folks.
- Food safety concerns.

Wayne Johnston – Farmer

- Member of the AHPT – to follow through on the work of the AHPT.
- Public representative.

- Cattle affected by industrial emissions.
- Humans affected by those same emissions.
- To protect our kids and grand kids through emission reductions.

Martha Kostuch – Prairie Acid Rain Coalition

- Affects of air pollution on animal health.
- Observing those effects for years.
- Calls from public who are concerned.
- There is a need for a central place for people to call in and ask advice – medical and otherwise.
- Actively involved with CASA on several project teams and on the BOD.
- Non-adversarial, collaborative process.
- Have fun, network, build relationships.

Alex Mackenzie – Alberta Health and Wellness (AHW)

- AHW is responsible for the health of Albertans
- Health survey – there is never enough data
- Understand linkages
- Listen to concerns
- Re-evaluate current initiatives
- Provide information for the team – human and public health

Geoff Granville – Shell Canada

- Toxicologist with a public health interest
- Better understanding, information gather and share, communication
- Get human health monitoring program running
- Relationships between industry and farmers
- Interested in better, credible data
- Move forward in the sphere of human and animal health

What are some of CASA's achievements?

Stakeholders explained some of the achievements that have been seen by their participation in CASA:

Flaring and Venting

- A 2001 target for solution gas flaring reduction was set at 25% relative to 1992 – a 62% reduction was achieved.

Acid Deposition

- Management system was developed and implemented to monitor acid deposition.

Vehicle Emissions Team

- Breath Easy project
- Diesel Particulate Filter Project underway
- Transportation Demand Management project in the initial stages

Other

- Airshed zones established
- Science symposium

6. Terms of reference for the implementation team

It was suggested that a small group be formed produce a first draft of a Terms of Reference for the team to review and comment on.

ACTION 1.1: Matthew Dance, Geoff Granville, and the co-chairs will draft a terms of reference for the Human and Animal Health Implementation team to comment on.

a. Identify key objectives and tasks for the team’s work plan

Comments were made regarding the Animal Health Project Team recommendation #6 as it may influence the key objectives and tasks of this team:

Recommendation #6:

The AHPT recommends that a Human and Animal Health Implementation Team be established to:

- Review and implement, if still appropriate, the recommendations from the Human Health Project Team.
- Implement recommendations from the Animal Health Project Team.

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

- The word implement is not appropriate – CASA does not implement recommendations.
- Ensure that the action happens, not that CASA does it.
- Oversee, monitor and evaluate

- Organize a workshop(s) to disseminate information about HERS to the farming community.

- Receive information about current and future research in the areas of human and animal health.

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

- More discussion is needed regarding “receive information”.
- What is meant by this?
- We can receive information indefinably – but this is not the purpose of CASA
- The purpose of collecting the information is to monitor what is happening in the world of human and animal health
- How would we be made aware of research?
- We are not going to review research
- We should only look at peer reviewed research.

- This group has not been established to be observers and translators of health research for the rest of CASA.
- The TOR should define a purpose and a timeframe.

➤ Provide input into current and future research.

- How will this be accomplished?
- Presumes that we will be invited to do this.
- For example, WISSA asked for input during phase two.
- This item could be a work plan item, but it does not seem to be a TOR item.

➤ Identify emerging issues in the areas of human and animal health, and recommend actions to address those issues.

- For instance, the effects of electromagnetic radiation on animal health.
- New issues would have to go to the CASA BOARD for approval.

➤ Provide information support to other project teams.

- What is the product of this?
- When and how would this occur?
- A response to requests from other groups.
- How do we evaluate the information available to us before we pass it on to other teams?
- What if we simply share the information that we do have.
- Perhaps a wording something like “Communicate the results of work...”
- This could be a standing action item for the team and not be included in the TOR

➤ Periodically evaluate, review and make any needed changes to the Herd and Environmental Record System and the Community Monitoring Brochure.

- There is an evaluation form going out with the HERS document to allow for feedback from the producers who use the document.
- The word periodic is a problem because it implies an open ended process rather than a discrete process.

More comments:

- It was noted that this is a preliminary discussion regarding the TOR for the HH/AH IT.
- The TOR must be approved by the CASA BOARD.
- There is an outstanding Data Issues action that should be addressed by the TOR.

ACTION 1.2: Matthew will forward the Animal Health Project Team and the Human Health Project Team’s final recommendations for review by the Human and Animal Health Implementation Team.

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

Formatted: Bullets and Numbering

b. Membership

Additional groups that may be interested in sitting at this table include:

- Alberta Agriculture, Food and Rural Development
- First Nations
- Agriculture Canada
- AUMA
- AAMD&C
- Health Units
- Council of Medical Officers of Health
- Surface Rights Board
- Alberta Energy
- Environment Canada
- Livestock Council
- Farmers Advocate
- Natural Resources Conservation Board (NRCB)
- Industry Associations

ACTION 1.3: Matthew will contact AAFR&D, Surface Rights Board and Farmers Advocate to enquire about their interest in joining this team.

ACTION 1.4: Penny Mosmann will contact Agriculture Canada to enquire about their interest in joining this team.

ACTION 1.5: Ruth Yanor will contact the Council of Medical Officers of Health to enquire about their interest in joining this team.

ACTION 1.6: Margaret Fisher will provide a name and organization to contact regarding the livestock industries interest at this table.

ACTION 1.7: Kim Eastlick will contact the NRCB to enquire about their interest in joining this team.

ACTION 1.8: Geoff Granville will contact the Chemical Industry Association to enquire about their interest in joining this team.

ACTION 1.9: John Squarek will contact the Electricity Generation Industry Association to enquire about their interest in joining this team.

c. Timeline

- Some members see the Human and Animal Health Implementation Team as being a standing committee to deal with Human and Animal Health issues on an ongoing basis.
- Under this model the team would meet less often but for a longer duration.

- Other team members feel that we should have a proper debate about this issue at the next meeting
- We should define our terms of reference then determine the time it will take to accomplish the TOR.
- It would be possible to have a big team to accomplish the tasks laid out in the TOR and then a small team to look at ongoing issues.

d. Funding

It was noted that the funding needed to fulfill the Terms of Reference will come from this table.

7. Process for moving forward
a. Selection of Co-chairs

Decision:

It was decided that Ruth Yanor would represent the Non-governmental Organizations as a co-chair of this team.

ACTION 1.10: The Government Sector will forward their co-chair selection to Matthew by the end of June.

b. Next Meeting

September 4th in Calgary from 9:30 – 3:30.

The following people will enquire to see if they can host the meeting:

Geoff Granville at Shell.

Penny Mosmann at Health Canada.

John Squarek at CAPP.

Kim Eastlick at the EUB.

8. Other Business

No other business.

9. Adjournment.

Donna Tingley adjourned the meeting at 3:35.